Hiring Decision and Onboarding Scorecard

The Core Principle

Hiring decisions are among the most consequential decisions leaders make. A single bad hire can cost 2-3x the salary in lost productivity, team disruption, and replacement costs. Yet most organizations use inconsistent hiring processes that rely too heavily on interviews and gut feel.

This checklist provides a structured evaluation framework with weighted criteria to help you make better hiring decisions and successfully integrate new team members.

Part 1: Pre-Hiring Preparation

Define the Role

What are we hiring for?

- [ ] Clear job description documented
- [ ] Key responsibilities defined
- [ ] Success metrics established
- [ ] Required vs. nice-to-have skills identified

What's the investment thesis?

- [ ] Why do we need this role now?
- [ ] What problem does this hire solve?
- [ ] What's the expected ROI?
- [ ] What's the timeline to productivity?

Establish Hiring Criteria

What are we looking for?

- [ ] Technical competence level required
- [ ] Industry experience required
- [ ] Domain knowledge required
- [ ] Soft skills required

What are deal-breakers?

- [ ] Disqualifier 1: _____
- [ ] Disqualifier 2: _____
- [ ] Disqualifier 3: _____

Part 2: Evaluation Framework

Scoring Rubric (1-5 scale)

Judgment & Decision-Making (Weight: 25%)

- [ ] Demonstrates sound reasoning
- [ ] Makes decisions with incomplete information
- [ ] Learns from mistakes
- [ ] Considers multiple perspectives

- Score: ___/5

Work Ethic & Reliability (Weight: 20%)

- [ ] Follows through on commitments
- [ ] Takes ownership of problems
- [ ] Doesn’t make excuses
- [ ] Maintains high standards

- Score: ___/5

Cultural Fit & Collaboration (Weight: 20%)

- [ ] Works well with others
- [ ] Shares our values
- [ ] Communicates clearly
- [ ] Contributes to team morale

- Score: ___/5

Domain Expertise (Weight: 20%)

- [ ] Has required technical skills
- [ ] Understands industry context
- [ ] Brings relevant experience
- [ ] Can hit the ground running

- Score: ___/5

Coachability & Growth Mindset (Weight: 15%)

- [ ] Open to feedback
- [ ] Wants to improve
- [ ] Asks good questions
- [ ] Takes initiative to learn

- Score: ___/5

Overall Assessment

Weighted Score Calculation:

- Judgment (25% × *__/5) =__*
- Work Ethic (20% × *__/5) =__*
- Cultural Fit (20% × *__/5) =__*
- Domain Expertise (20% × *__/5) =__*
- Coachability (15% × *__/5) =__*
- **TOTAL SCORE: ___/5**

Part 3: Interview Process

Phone Screen (15 minutes)

- [ ] Candidate understands the role
- [ ] Candidate is genuinely interested
- [ ] No obvious red flags
- [ ] Worth proceeding to next round

First Interview (60 minutes)

- [ ] Assess judgment through behavioral questions
- [ ] Understand work history and motivation
- [ ] Evaluate communication skills
- [ ] Gauge cultural fit

Second Interview (60 minutes)

- [ ] Deep dive on domain expertise
- [ ] Technical assessment (if applicable)
- [ ] Problem-solving scenarios
- [ ] Reference check readiness

Final Interview (60 minutes)

- [ ] Meet with team members
- [ ] Assess collaboration potential
- [ ] Discuss expectations and role clarity
- [ ] Evaluate enthusiasm for the role

Part 4: Reference Checks

Call at least 2 references:

Reference 1: _____

- [ ] How long did you work together?
- [ ] What was their role?
- [ ] What were their strengths?
- [ ] What could they improve?
- [ ] Would you hire them again?
- [ ] Any concerns?

Reference 2: _____

- [ ] How long did you work together?
- [ ] What was their role?
- [ ] What were their strengths?
- [ ] What could they improve?
- [ ] Would you hire them again?
- [ ] Any concerns?

Part 5: Final Decision

Hiring Recommendation

Hire? [ ] Yes [ ] No [ ] Maybe

If Yes:

- [ ] Offer letter prepared
- [ ] Compensation package agreed
- [ ] Start date confirmed
- [ ] Onboarding plan ready

If No:

- [ ] Reason for rejection documented
- [ ] Feedback provided to candidate
- [ ] Continue search

If Maybe:

- [ ] What additional information do we need?
- [ ] Who else should we talk to?
- [ ] Timeline for final decision

Part 6: Onboarding Plan

First Week

- [ ] Welcome meeting with manager
- [ ] Office/system setup complete
- [ ] Team introductions
- [ ] Role clarity session
- [ ] First week priorities documented

First Month

- [ ] Weekly 1:1s with manager
- [ ] Key stakeholder meetings
- [ ] Product/service deep dive
- [ ] Customer/user interactions
- [ ] 30-day check-in

First 90 Days

- [ ] Monthly progress reviews

- [ ] Skill development plan
- [ ] Integration into team
- [ ] Performance against expectations
- [ ] 90-day evaluation

Part 7: 90-Day Evaluation

Is this hire working out?

- [ ] Meeting performance expectations
- [ ] Integrating well with team
- [ ] Demonstrating required skills
- [ ] Taking initiative
- [ ] Ready for increased responsibility

Overall Assessment:

- [ ] Exceeding expectations
- [ ] Meeting expectations
- [ ] Below expectations
- [ ] Needs improvement plan

Next Steps:

- [ ] Promote or expand responsibilities
- [ ] Continue current trajectory
- [ ] Performance improvement plan
- [ ] Transition/exit plan
